Jury Meeting Minute
Call for a Postdoctoral Researcher
Reference IMM/CT/53-2023

Instituto de Medicina Molecular João Lobo Antunes (iMM) opens a call for hiring a **Postdoctoral Researcher** correspondent to the initial level according to the Applicable Regulation, under an **Unfixed-term contract**, with the funding support by **Plano de Recuperação e Resiliência (PRR)**, under the project **Centros de Tecnologia e Inovação (CTI)**.

The job advert was published in EURAXESS Portugal on 10th of July 2023 and also disseminated in iMM website.

The call was opened from 11th of July until 31st of August 2023, having applied the following candidates:

- Alan Luiz

- André Leitão

- Asma Ressaissi

- João Fernandes

- Lis Lobo

- Mohamed Amin

On the 4th of September 2023, the jury composed Professors Marc Veldhoen (President of the Jury and Responsible for the Project), Cristina Ferreira and Ana de Almeida (all PhD's) met to analyze the application documents (Motivation Letter in English, Detailed CV, PhD Certificate and other documents that applicant may consider to be relevant to prove the scientific course).

All admitted applications were analyzed according to the following selection method, which was also indicated in the job advert:

- 1st Phase: Curricular Evaluation: 60% and Motivation Letter: 30%;
- 2nd Phase: Interview: 10%.

Curricular Evaluation (60%)
The curricular evaluation was based in the following criteria:
- Executed and/or published scientific work, with special emphasis on areas related to the work plan (30%);
- Research experience and relevant knowledge in the area of the proposed work plan as described in the candidate profile (30%).

Motivation letter (30%)
The motivation letter analysis was based in the following criteria:

- Motivation and interest for the activities to be performed (20%)
- Command of the English language (10%).

The analysis and discrimination of the admitted candidates' classification in the First Phase of current process are presented in the table of Annex I attached to this minute.

Interview (10%)

Following the evaluation of the 1st Phase, 3 (three) applicants obtained the highest classification with a minimum of 70%. The applicants are identified below:
- André Leitão
- João Fernandes
- Lis Lobo

The interview was held on 7th September 2023 and the jury considered the following criteria:
- Motivation for the position and work (3%);
- Organization and work ethic, pratical experience in techniques (3%);
- Command of English (2%);
- Career plans (2%)
-

The analysis and discrimination of the admitted candidates' classification in the Second Phase and total classification in both phases are presented in the table of Annex II attached to this minute.

Lisbon, 18th of September 2023

Marc Veldhoen
(President of the Jury)

Cristina Ferreira

Ana de Almeida

ANNEX I - Employment Contract - Ref. IMM/CT/53-2023

Applicants	Curriculum Analysis (60%)								Motivation Letter (30%)								Total ANNEX I
	Executed and/or published scientific work, with special emphasis on areas related to the work plan (30%)				Research experience and relevant knowledge in the area of the proposed work plan as described in the candidate profile (30%)				Motivation and interest for the activities to be performed (20%)				Command of the English and Portuguese language (10%)				
Name of Jury	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	
Alan Luiz	14,00	13,00	14,00	13,67	5,00	5,00	5,00	5,00	1,00	5,00	4,00	3,33	8,00	7,00	8,00	7,67	29,67
	MSc (mitochondria), PhD (mental diorders); Genomics/gentics taining: 2016-2023 immuno lab tech. Publications out of the calls scope.	PhD in nursing in public health, publications not related with area of work.	PhD in nursing in public health, publications not related with the lab´s work.		Some work in an immuno-lab, no details of experience or techniques at all. No PCR, FACS, mouse work mentioned.	No mention of any of the techniques required, no mouse work.	The candidate does not mention the experience with any of the techniques required.		Not even addressed to anyone. No details about techniques or interests, no indication of having looked at the lab, institute or any past work.	Doesn't indicate how he is suitable to perform the activities. Nothing to indicate experience in the techniques required.	There is no specific motivation, nothing specific for the position mentioned.		Command of English seems fine, PT native.	Portuguese native, Fair English.	PT native, English seems fine.		
André Leitão	22,00	22,00	23,00	22,33	27,00	28,00	27,00	27,33	10,00	11,00	10,00	10,33	10,00	10,00	10,00	10,00	70,00
	PhD in Molecular Biology, Doctor of Veterinary Medicine: neuroscience.	PhD in Neurobiology with publications in the area.	PhD in Molecular Biology, Doctor of Veterinary Medicine: neuroscience, publications in this field with some relevance to the lab.		Techician experience: publications outside domain.Technical expertise; cloning, PCR, cell culture, IHC, WB, mouse work (no flow).	cell culture (neurons), cloning, experience with mouse models, no cytometry, no FELASA, no BSL-2.	The techniques that the candidate seems experienced in are good (cell culture (neurons), cloning, experience with mouse models, no cytometry, no FELASA, no BSL-2).		Directed at iMM. But, no motivation for lab, no immunology, no reference to lab publications or past work.	No indication of suitability to work in the specific lab.	No indication of suitability to work in the specific lab, no specifics mentioned why the candidate would be good for this specific position.		In the US. EN very good, PT native.	Portuguese native, Very good English.	Portuguese native, Very good English.		

Cristina Ferreira   [signature]   Ana Santos Almeida

Candidate	18,00	17,00	17,00	17,33	19,00	24,00	21,00	21,33	7,00	6,00	7,00	6,67	8,00	7,00	6,00	7,00	52,33
Asma Ressaissi	PhD in Biology "Pharmaceutical and toxicological Biochemistry', MSc foodsafty. Publications not directly relevant; some techniques transferable	PhD in biochemistry, some publications using human cell lines. Refereces document file damaged	PhD in biochemistry, some publications using human cell lines. Background of past work not directly relevcant to this position.		No technical skills or experiences In CV. Seems to have genetic experience (PCR) and cell culture, WB. No mice or FACS.	Experience with cell culture (human cell lines), DNA isolation, PCR, no BSL-2, no FELASA, no cytometry, no mouse work.	The techniques that the candidate seems to have some relevant expeiences (human cell lines), DNA isolation, PCR, no BSL-2, no FELASA, no cytometry, no mouse work).		Motivation letter is standard, no mentioning of institut, lab, past lab work or publications. Somewhat more personal details.	Refers suitability to some of the requirements in the letter.	A more general letter without specifics related to the position or lab. Refers suitability to some of the requirements in the letter.		English very good, PT non-native.	Non-native Portuguese speaker, Very good English.	English very good, PT non-native.		

Candidate	25,00	24,00	25,00	24,67	27,00	27,00	27,00	27,00	11,00	11,00	12,00	11,33	9,00	9,00	9,00	9,00	72,00
João Fernandes	PhD, agronomic engineering, publications not all directly relevant, some are, techniques and experience are very relevant.	PhD in Agricultural engeneering, most work in plant biology. More recent publications using mamalian cell lines and rat model relevant for position.	PhD, agronomic engineering, publications not all directly relevant, some techniques and experience are very relevant.		DNA/RNA extraction RTqPCR, Cloning, Protein extraction, SDS PAGE, Western Blotting, Mamalian cell culture Viability assays iochemical markers of cancer and inflammation, Fluorescent microscopy No FACS.	Experience with cell culture (cell lines) and with a rat model, DNA isolation, PCR, no BSL-2, no FELASA, no cytometry.	The techniques that the candidate seems to have some relevant expeiences (cell lines) and with a rat model, DNA isolation, PCR, no BSL-2, no FELASA, no cytometry).		Lengthy, no direct mentioning of the institute, lab, past projects or papers from the lab. Not clear if a technical/post doc position is sought.	CV very disorganized, with mistakes in dates, etc. Motivation letter refers experience in some techniques required for the position.	CV is not well presented, there seem mistakes in dates. Motivation letter refers experience in some techniques required for the position, which are positive.		English is good, native Portuguese.	Native Portuguese, Good English.	Native Portuguese, Good English.		

Candidate	24,00	23,00	23,00	23,33	28,00	28,00	28,00	28,00	15,00	14,00	14,00	14,33	7,00	7,00	6,00	6,67	72,33
Lis Lobo	Masters degree in Medical Parasitology and a PhD inBiomedical Sciences within the speciality of Cellular and Molecular Biology: ongoing grants to 2024:; most publications are not papers but poster and conference presentations. Actual papers are out of scope for this project, but have relevant techniques.	PhD in cellular and molecular biology, few publications mostly not directly relevant. Techniques are relevant and important to the lab.	PhD in cellular and molecular biology, few publications mostly not directly relevant , good technical range. Grants still ongoing.		cell line cultures, cytotoxicity and genotoxicity assays, speed of action tests, stage-specificactivity, cytotoxic, cytostatic, mitochondrial membrane potential, and gametocytocidal activity, as well as invivo antiplasmodial activity assays using murine models; cell cultures,multiparametric flow cytometry, PCR, RT-qPCR and cloning and transfection of bacteria.	cell culture, DNA isolation, PCR, BSL-2, flow cytometry, mouse model, no FELASA.	The techniques that the candidate seems experienced in are good (cell culture, DNA isolation, PCR, BSL-2, flow cytometry, mouse model, but no FELASA).		Mentioning of instutute, and lab. Limited additional details. Is after a post-doc position.	Indicates suitability to some requirements of the position. It is not clear position regarding ongoing grants or if looking for research position.	Indicates suitability to some requirements of the position. She mentions the institute and labs and seems to be aware of both.		EN is decent (B2), PT native.	Native Portuguese, Fair English.	Native Portuguese, Fair English.		

Mohamed Amin	12,00	10,00	12,00	11,33	10,00	8,00	8,00	8,67	5,00	5,00	4,00	4,67	1,00	3,00	1,00	1,67	26,33
	Professor Microbiology; publications are largely out of scope for this project. Research plans seem not to fit with the application, lab or institute.	PhD in Microbiology, publications not relevant for application. Appears to be looking for PI position (future independent research program in the cv).	PhD in Microbiology, publications less relevant for application. Appears to be looking for an independent position.		DNA isolation, bacterial cultured, most experience seems teaching. Limited info on technical knwoledge and experience.	DNA isolation, no cell culture or any of the other skills.	DNA isolation, no cell culture or any of the other skills that are important for this position.		Very general letter without specifics: no lab, instutue or anything is mentioned.	No indication of suitability to work in the specific lab.	No indication of having looked at the lab, the suitability to work with the requested techniques is absent. The motivation letter is very general.		EN is good, no PT.	Non Portuguese language, good English.	Non Portuguese language, good English.		

ANNEX II - Employment Contract - Ref. IMM/CT/53-2023

Applicants	Interview (10%)																		Total ANNEX II	Total ANNEX I + ANNEX II
	Motivation for the position and work (3%)				Organization and work ethic, practical experience in techniques (3%)				Command of English (2%)				Careers plans (2%)					
Name of Jury	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average	Marc Veldhoen	Cristina Ferreira	Ana de Almeida	Average		
	1,50	1,50	1,50	1,50	1,50	1,60	1,50	1,53	1,80	1,90	1,90	1,87	1,00	1,20	1,20	1,13	6,03	76,03
André Leitão	André is highly motivated. He is a young investigator with plans to continue his own ideas and projects and forsees a carrer in science. Immunology is an area of interest, but not his core expertise.	André is very motivated and wishes to pursue a career in science with the final objective of having his own lab. This position might not offer the best fit to his future objectives.	André is very motivated but this position might not offer the best fit to his future objectives. He is clearly after a good post-doc position with an eye on possibly progressing to become a PI. This position is not likely to suit his needs and does not align with his plans.		André is very driven. He seems organised, is a team player, but also independent. He has good technical experience, relevant are DNA isolation, cell culture, some mouse work, but not flow cytometry.	André appears organized and is used to work independently. He has experience in some of the techniques required.	André is organized and is used to work independently. He has experience in some of the techniques required, clealy able to learn. His motivation is high, but directed towards a indipendent project, while this position will not offer him this.		Command of English language is very good.	Excellent spoken of English language.	Excellent spoken of English language.		André is a very strong candidate, who clearly wants to persue a carrer in science. The jury did find that for this particular position, he is less suitable. Also taking into account his availability to start, which is not in line with the project start date.	André is very driven. He wishes to pursue a career with the objective of becoming a PI. He would be available to start at a later date than desirable.	André is very driven. He wishes to pursue a career with the objective of becoming a PI. He may not be motivated with this position is a more serving role.			
	2,70	2,60	2,70	2,67	2,60	2,60	2,60	2,60	1,60	1,70	1,70	1,67	1,80	1,80	1,80	1,80	8,73	80,73
João Fernandes	João is motivated. He takes care of ordering and maintaining cell lines for the lab, he is available immediately.	João has experience in collaborating and assisting others. He does lab ordering and maintains cell lines for other lab members. He understands well the position´s requirements and is a good fit.	João is motivated, more that came across on his motivation letter. He already has a semi-labmanager role (ordering and maintaining cell lines for lab). He is available immediately.		João likes to work in a team. He would like to make career progression, but also sees the benefit of teamwork and exploring new techniques. He is responsible, plans his day, including requests from others. He has expertise in cell culture, PCR, some animal work (no FELASA).	João appears very organized. He plans his work ahead and has experience in lab management tasks. He is a team player, and has experience in several of the techniques required.	João seems organized. He plans his work ahead and has experience in lab management tasks. He is a team player, and has experience in several of the techniques required for this position. Will need to learn others, but seems very capable.		Command of English language is good.	Very good spoken of English language.	Very good spoken of English language.		João is a young investigator that could benefit from new experience. He is well situated to take a dual role of post-doc with lab-manager responsibilities.	João is interested in working in a new field in a team setting and the requirements of this position suit his future plans well.	João is interested in changing direction in his career. This is a new field for him and he is motivated by it. This position could suit his future plans well.			
	2,40	2,40	2,40	2,40	2,70	2,60	2,60	2,63	1,00	0,80	0,90	0,90	1,70	1,70	1,70	1,70	7,63	79,97
Lis Lobo	Lis is motivated, seems ready to take on a new challenge. Likes lab work and culture. Is keen to help and learn.	Lis is motivated and interested in continuing to learn and improve her skills.	Lis is motivated and interested in the postion and lab. She is somewhat hesitant due to some language barrier, but makes her motivation clear.		Lis is highly oganised, uses calender to plan ahead. She had expience with cell culture, PCR, animals (but not handling) and Flow cytometry.	Lis is organized and plans her work in advance. She has experience in several of the required techniques (doesn't hold a FELASA certificate).	Lis is highly oganised-she plans her work very well. She has experience in most techniques, but it is not clear how much was hands on and how much was done with others.		Commant of English language is sufficint, but needs improvement. She is aware, and this is a motivation to apply for our international lab.	Spoken english is poor, but she looks forward to improve.	Lis command of spoke English needs improvement and may hold her back a little. She is clearly motivated to improve this, and she mentioned this as well.		Lis is highly motivated, ready for a new challenge where she can grow in learning new techniques and her scientific career. This possition could be a very good stepping stone, and she seems ready for the position and challenge.	Liz would like to widen her research interests and improve her language skills. In the future she would like to take a post-doctoral position.	Liz would like to widen her research interests and improve her language skills. This position will offer this and may suit her very well. She does have the desire to become an independent post-doc, which is a good goal.			